

Structrual Materials Development and Heavy Liquid Metal Technology for Advanced Nuclear Reactors

Jürgen Konys

INSTITUTE FOR APPLIED MATERIALS – MATERIAL PROCESS TECHNOLOGY (IAM-WPT)



KIT – University of the State of Baden-Wuerttemberg and National Research Center of the Helmholtz Association

www.kit.edu

Lead-cooled Nuclear Reactors/Systems





Accelerator Driven (Subcritical) System

- Transmutation of long-lived radioactive isotopes in nuclear waste
- Power generation
- Liquid lead (Pb) or lead-bismuth eutectic (LBE) as spallation target and primary coolant
- Maximum temperature, typically
 - 450 500°C for regular operation
 - Periodically 550°C (according to plant design)

Lead-Cooled Fast Reactor

- One of the concepts for the 4th generation of nuclear power plants (Gen IV)
- In the long-term, Pb as primary coolant at maximum ca. 800°C
- Short- to mid-term: Pb- or LBE-cooled at 450 550°C



Activities at KIT / IAM-WPT related to ADS and LFR



CORRIDA: Corrosion-testing in dynamic lead alloys







Technical data

- Material: SS 316-Ti (DIN 1.4571)
- Developed length: 36 m
- Liquid metal: ~1000 kg LBE
- Mass flow: 5.3 kg/s (steady state)
- T_{max} = 550°C (test-sections, oxygen control-box)
- T_{min} = 350–385°C depending on T_{max} at inlet of EM-pump
- Oxygen control:
- Gas with adjustable O₂-content introduced at T_{max}

Operating data

- Commissioning in July 2003
- ca. 70,000 h of effective operation at Tmax = 450 to 550°C
- Longest exposure time of specimens: 20,000 h

Impact of oxygen addition to Pb alloys on steel corrosion





5

- Stimulation of the oxidation of steel constituents
 - Formation of an oxide scale on the steel surface
 - Spatial separation of the steel from liquid metal
 - Reduced dissolution rate or risk of embrittlement
- Steel constituents must be less noble than the constituents of the liquid metal
 - Applicable to Pb, lead-bismuth
 - Not applicable to lead-lithium (Pb17Li) or Na
- However, thick oxide scales impair heattransfer across the steel surface
 - Practical limit of oxygen addition
- Relevant to
 - Lead-cooled fast reactor (LFR)Accelerator driven system ("Actinide Burner")

Components of an oxygen control system



Sensors for on-line monitoring

Electrochemical oxygen monitoring

- Solid electrolyte on the basis of yttria-stabilized zirconia (YSZ)
- Metal/metal-oxide or Pt/gas reference electrode

Issues to be addressed (in general)

- Compatibility with the use in Pb alloys (YSZ/steel joint)
- Accuracy

6

Long-term reliability

Licensing for nuclear application

- Structural stability of the YSZ product used
- Risk of contamination in case of electrolyte cracking

Oxygen-transfer device(s)

"Classic" mass transfer across the interface between oxygen source/sink and the liquid metal

Туре	Oxygen source	Oxygen sink
Solid- liquid	PbO	(less noble metals)
Gas-liquid	Ar, H ₂ O, air	Ar-H ₂

Long-term experience from operating experimental facilities for testing materials (steels) in oxygen-containing Pb alloys exists

Electrochemical oxygen sensors for liquid lead alloys



Basic components	Sensor output					
 Solid electrolyte Yttria stabilized zirconia (YSZ) Tubes with 4.5–4.8 mole% Y₂O₃ "Thimble" with 3 mole% Y₂O₃ 	 Voltmeter reading, E Measure of the chemical potential of oxygen in the liquid metal May in general depend on the specific combination of the sensor with a high-impedance voltmeter 					
 Reference electrode Metal/metal-oxide like Bi/Bi₂O₃ and In/In₂O₃ with Mo wire as electric lead Pt/air using steel wire with platinised tip as electric lead 	Ideal sensor/voltmeter system Ideal zero-current potential: $E^* = \frac{(\mu_{O_2;Ref} - \mu_{O_2})}{4F}$					
 Second (working) electrode The liquid Pb alloy Auxiliant wire or the steel housing 	• Calculated oxygen concentration, c_0 : log(c_/mass%) = C_+ $\frac{C_2}{C_2}$ = 10.080 $\frac{E^*/V}{C_2}$					
of the sensor serves as part of the electric lead	 C1 and C2 are constants specific for the reference electrode 					

7

Oxygen sensors developed at KIT





8

- Long electrolyte tube (Ø 6×255 mm)
- Polymer sealing ring in sufficient distance from the liquid metal
- Cooling fins for reducing the thermal load on the sealing ring
- Steel sheath for protecting the electrolyte from shear forces, serving as electric lead on the liquid-metal side
- Reference electrodes
 - (Steel)Pt/air
 - (Mo)Bi/Bi₂O₃

~3 mV at 300°C ~11 mV at 700°C (Mo/stainless steel)





F 100 µm H

Testing of the sensor accuracy

Adjusting known oxygen potentials in LBE

Pb/PbO (oxygen saturation)

Co/CoO

Fe/Fe-oxide equilibria

Fe and Co added in the form of powder

Stabilization of these potentials using gases with varying oxygen partial pressure

Ar

9

Ar + air

 $Ar + H_2$

Temperature range: 350–700°C

Digital multimeter with high impedance >1GW

Sensors were tested without metallic sheath (Mo electrode as auxiliary electric lead), so as to minimize unintentional contamination of the LBE with metals.



Sensor accuracy required for efficient oxygen control in HLMs





Experience

- Half an order of magnitude in oxygen concentration can significantly change oxidation mechanisms for F/M steels
- Reproducibility under service conditions better than +20 mV/-45 mV at 400°C and +30 mV/ -65 mV at 700°C is needed

Minimum requirement

- Better than ± 20 mV at 400°C; ± 30 mV at 700°C
- Range of actual c_o from 0.5 to 2 c_o;nominal

Practical limit

 ± 5 mV, corresponding to ± 10% in c_o, resulting from uncertainty in thermodynamic data used for calculating reference potentials

Pt/air sensor and voltmeter with $R_v > 1G\Omega$



Accuracy of measurement resulting from comparison with metal/metal-oxide equilibria adjusted in LBE



Fe oxide equilibria

- Stepwise cooling or heating
- Ar-15% H₂ bubbling continuously through the LBE (5 ml/min) or quasi-stagnant
- Oxygen potentials move from Fe-oxide to Mo/MoO₂ equilibrium with temperature variation (Mo comes from wire submerged in the LBE)

Co/CoO

- Stepwise cooling
- Ar 5.0 bubbling continuously through the LBE (5 ml/min)
- Periodically addition of air (5 ml/min) at 700 and 650°C
- Maximum deviation from theoretical prediction < 6 mV

Pb/PbO

- Stepwise cooling
- Ar 5.0 bubbling continuously through the LBE (5 ml/min)
- Maximum deviation from theoretical prediction < 4 mV

Bi/Bi_2O_3 sensor and voltmeter with $R_V > 1G\Omega$



Accuracy of measurement resulting from comparison with metal/metal-oxide equilibria adjusted in LBE



Fe oxide equilibria

- Stepwise cooling or heating
- Ar-15% H₂ mostly quasi-stagnant
- Maximum deviation from theoretical prediction < 8 mV

Co/CoO

- Stepwise cooling
- Ar 5.0 bubbling continuously through the LBE (5 ml/min)
- Maximum deviation from theoretical prediction < 15 mV

Pb/PbO

- Stepwise cooling
- Ar 5.0 bubbling continuously through the LBE (5 ml/min)
- Maximum deviation from theoretical prediction < 8 mV

Oxygen-transfer device of the CORRIDA loop

Gas/liquid

- Transfer across a plane liquid-metal surface
- 5.3 kg/s LBE
- ~500 cm³/min gas (referred to 25°C)
- λ -probe for monitoring p_{O_2} in the gas-space
- Gas mixture optimized for maintaining c_o=10⁻⁶ mass% at 550°C
 - 500 cm³/min Ar humidified at 18°C (p_{H₂O} = 0.02 bar)
 - Continuous addition of 1–1.5 cm³/min ai (manually adjusted)
- Gas mixture used for maintaining c_o=10⁻⁶ mass% at 450°C
 - 500 cm³/min Ar humidified at 18°C (p_{H₂O} = 0.02 bar)
 - Discontinuous addition of 0.5 cm³/min air(manually adjusted)





Performance of the oxygen-control system





FM steels tested in the CORRIDA loop



Concentration (in mass%) of alloying elements other than Fe

	Cr	Мо	W	V	Nb	Та	Y	Mn	Ni	Si	С
T91-A	9.44	0.850	<0.003	0.196	0.072	n.a.	n.a.	0.588	0.100	0.272	0.075
Т91-В	8.99	0.89	0.01	0.21	0.06	n.a.	n.a.	0.38	0.11	0.22	0.1025
E911*	8.50– 9.50	0.90– 1.10	0.90– 1.10	0.18– 0.25	0.060– 0.100	-	-	0.30– 0.60	0.10– 0.40	0.10– 0.50	0.09– 0.13
EUROFER	8.82	<0.0010	1.09	0.20	n.a.	0.13	n.a.	0.47	0.020	0.040	0.11
EF-ODS-A	9.40	0.0040	1.10	0.185	n.a.	0.08	0.297†	0.418	0.0670	0.115	0.072
EF-ODS-B	8.92	0.0037	1.11	0.185	n.a.	0.078	0.192†	0.408	0.0544	0.111	0.067
* Nominal composition † In the form of yttria (Y_2O_3) Non		ninally 9 i	mass% C	Cr		1 Elem	onte hoci	des Cr th	1 at are like	elv to	
× × 2 3/							improve oxidation performance				

Microstructure



Mainly ferritic: ODS-A, ODS-B

15 Seminar on Corrosion Aspects in HLMs, October 31, 2014, INEST, Hefei, China

MYRRHA design data used

Design operating parameters



Material	Temperature (°C)	Surface area (m²)	Oxygen conc. (mass%)	Average flow velocity (m/s)		
	400	120				
2461	350	419 (360)	~10-7	To be specified		
SIGL	310	125	~10			
	270	1697 (1596)				
15 15Ti	410	194	~10-7	To be specified		
15-1511	270	1150	10	to be specified		
	450	4				
T91	350	(59)	~10 ⁻⁷	To be specified		
	270	1 (102)				

		Duration (days)	Temperature (°C)
Start-u	ıp	180	270°C
1 st Pov	wer cycle	90	Components at design operating temperature; temperature transients
Downt	ime	90	270°C
Early operating stages 2 nd Po	wer cycle	90	As above

Quantification of corrosion

Goal of quantification

- Material loss, average of general corrosion and maximum of local corrosion
- Thickness of adherent (oxide) scale
- Overall change in dimensions, including the scale
- Amount of metals transferred to the liquid metal

Metallographic method (cylindrical specimens)

- Measurement of initial diameter in a
 - laser micrometer with 0.1 µm resolution



- Diameter of unaffected material and thickness of corrosion scales determined in a microscope (LOM) at minimum ×500 magnification, with 1 µm resolution
- Occurrence of different corrosion modes on opposing sides of the re-measured diameter is considered in the evaluation



Detailed quantification procedure

On the evaluated cross section

- Start at 0° position
- Identify corrosion mode in this position
- Measure scale thickness
- Measure diameter sound material
- Identify corrosion mode and quantify scale on the other side of the diameter (180°)

□ Respective measurements after turning by 30°

- Overall 12 sets of measurements
- 6 independent (0°, 30°, 60° ...)
- Each one repetition (180°, 210°, 240° ...)

First round of measurements (partners quantify their own experiments) almost finished.

Second round will be started as soon as possible.



T91: Qualitative performance in oxygencontaining LBE at 550°C, v = 2 m/s and $c_0 = 1.6 \times 10^{-6}$ mass% (I)





- Oxidation
- Oxide scale consists of
 - Magnetite (Fe₃O₄)
 - Cr-deficient spinel (Fe(Fe_xCr_{1-x})₂O₄)
 - Internal Oxidation Zone (IOZ)
- Magnetite is mostly missing, i. e., Fe is partially dissolved by the liquid metal (or eroded after Fe₃O₄ formation?)
- Inclusions of Pb and Bi inside the scale, espesially after long exposure times

T91: Quantification of oxidation in oxygencontaining LBE at 550°C, v = 2 m/s and $c_0 = 1.6 \times 10^{-6} \text{ mass}\%$ (II)



T91: Oxidation

- Metal recession (loss of cross-section)
- Compromises the structural integrity of plant components
- Determined from measurements in the LOM (generally six measurements per investigated cross-section)
- Includes internal oxidation
- Local variation significantly increases with increasing exposure time
- Optimistic prediction: 50–70 µm after 100,000 h
- Worst-case: 100 µm after 4 years



80

T91: Quantification of oxidation in oxygen-containing LBE at 550°C, v = 2 m/s and $c_0 = 1.6 \times 10^{-6}$ mass% (III)



- Thickness of different layers of the oxide scale
- May affect heat transfer in the case of thermally-loaded plant components
- Generally twelve measurements per investigated cross-section
- Thickness of spinel layer significantly varies locally with increasing exposure time
- Average thickness of the spinel layer is in the order of the metal recession

Fe flux into the LBE can be estimated from the spinel layer thickness





Kinetics of oxide-scale growth for T91-B at 450°C, 2 m/s and 10⁻⁶ mass% oxygen (I)





Parabolic:	$\Delta \mathbf{x}^2 = \mathbf{k}_2 \mathbf{t}$
Parabolic after faster initial kinetics:	$\Delta x^2 = k_2 t + C_2$
Logarithmic:	$\Delta x = k_{log} log (t + t_0) + C_{log}$
Paralinear:	$\frac{d\Delta x}{dt} = \frac{k_p}{d\Delta x} + k_1$



Local internal oxidation was not considered

Thickness of the oxide layers slightly lower (by ~20%) for T91-A

Data extrapolation for T91 at 450°C, 2 m/s and 10⁻⁶ mass% oxygen (II)





Parabolic:	$\Delta \mathbf{x}^2 = \mathbf{k}_2 \mathbf{t}$					
Parabolic after faster kinetics:	$\Delta x^2 = k_2 t + C_2$					
Paralinear mode	I of oxide scale growth					
Logarithmic:	$\Delta x = k_{\log} (t + t_0) + C_{\log}$					

Exposure time (years)	1	5	10						
T91-A \rightarrow Upper limit of Cr content specified for T9									
Δx_{M} (µm)	10	13 – 22	13 – 31						
∆x _{SP} (µm)	7	8 – 14	8 – 20						
∆x _{ST} (µm)	9	20	28						
T91-B \rightarrow Lowe	er limit of C	r content specifi	ed for T91						
Δx_{M} (µm)	12	15 – 26	15 – 36						
∆x _{SP} (µm)	8	10 – 16	10 – 23						
∆x _{s⊤} (µm)	12	26	37						

Quantitative results from experiments in the CORRIDA loop: T91 in LBE at 450–550°C, 2 m/s and 10⁻⁶% dissolved oxygen



Accelerated oxidation



- Thickness of magnetite approximates the overall increase in specimen radius
- Dissolved Fe from balancing the mass consumed and present in oxides
- Extrapolation of data naturally depends strongly on the type of rate law assumed

□ Solution-based corrosion

- Significantly increased material loss
- Comparatively small database for kinetic analysis
- Underlying corrosion mechanisms may differ for the particular data points



Quantitative results from experiments in the CORRIDA loop: Type 316 in LBE at 450–550°C, 2 m/s and 10⁻⁶% dissolved oxygen



Accelerated oxidation

- Observed locally at 550°C
- In parts continuous scale after long exposure time
- Not observed at 450°C



Solution-based corrosion

- Only few sites on investigated specimens may be affected
- Mostly selective leaching of Ni and Cr
- But also general dissolution of all steel elements at 450°C
- Incubation time decreases from around 5000 h at 450°C to 1000 h at 550°C



Corrosion of type 316-Ti austenitic steels in oxygen-containing LBE (1)



Protective scaling

- Thin oxide scale (< 1 μm) consisting of Cr- or Si-rich oxide layers
- Might have evolved from thin films already existing on the steel surface before exposure
- Similar to the scale formed by pre-oxidation in dry gas (Ar)
- Locally long-lasting phenomenon on specimens exposed at 450/550°C, 10⁻⁶ mass% O in the test-sections of the loop
- Not observed on tube samples taken from the hot leg of the loop; effect of long exposure time and variying c_o (?)





SS 316-Ti specimen in the test-section of the loop after exposure for 3495 h to oxygen-containing flowing LBE at 550°C and cO \approx 10–6 mass%

Corrosion of type 316-Ti austenitic steels in oxygen-containing LBE (2)

Accelerated oxidation

- Starts locally where the thin oxide scale lost integrity or did not form
- Formation of Fe(Fe_xCr_{1-x})₂O₄, Fe₃O₄ and an internal oxidation zone; the latter two depending on oxygen content, temperature (or flow velocity)
- The thicker scale spreads on the steel surface with time and becomes partially continuous
- Varying c₀ (mostly lower than 10⁻⁶ mass%) seems to promote accelerated oxidation



SS 316-Ti specimens in the testsections of the loop:



After exposure for 3495 h at 550°C and $c_{\rm O} \approx 10^{-6}$ mass%



After exposure for 10,006 h at 550°C and variying $c_{\rm O}$



Materials	316 L (plate), 1.4571 (rod), 1.4970 (rod), T91 (two different plates)									
Liquid metal	LBE	LBE								
Temp. /°C	550 450 400									
Oxygen /mass%	10 ^{-7*}	10 ^{-7*} 10 ^{-7†} 10 ⁻								
Flow velocity /(m s ⁻¹)	2 [‡]	2								
T _{min} /°C (Loop)	~385	~350 ~350								
Exposure	~300–2000	~500–9000	~1000–5000							
time /h	(4 samples)	(7 samples)	(3 samples)							
* Temporary excur	* Temporary excursion to $\sim 10^{-4}$ mass% for 450 b, after 1450 b total									

* Temporary excursion to $\sim 10^{-4}$ mass% for 450 h, after 1450 h tota runtime of the experiment.

⁺ Temporary excursion to $\sim 10^{-5}$ mass% for 600 h, after 1200 h total runtime of the experiment.

[‡] Varying flow velocity, around 1.5 m/s during the first 700 h of total runtime of the experiment.

(Fe – Bal.)		1.1 Materials												T	
Austenitic steels	Cr	Ni	Мо	Mn	Si	Cu	V	w	AI	Ті	С	Ν	Р	S	В
316L	16.73	9.97	2.05	1.81	0.67	0.23	0.07	0.02	0.018	-	0.019	0.029	0.032	0.0035	-
1.4970	15.95	15.4	1.2	1.49	0.52	0.026	0.036	< 0.005	0.023	0.44	0.1	0.009	< 0.01	0.0036	< 0.01
1.4571	17.50	12	2.0	2.0	1.0	-	-	-	-	0.70	0.08	-	0.045	0.015	-

1.4970 (15-15Ti)



- HV₃₀ = 253;
- Grain size ranged from 20 to 65 μm;
- Intersecting deformation twins.

316L



- HV₃₀ = 132;
- Grain size averaged 50 µm (G 5.5); Annealing twins.





- HV₃₀ = 245;
- Grain size averaged 15 μm (G 9.5).

Shape and dimensions of sample for corrosion tests







Austenitic steels after exposure in the CORRIDA loop



- □ 400°C/ 10⁻⁷ mass% oxygen
 - Only protective scaling at up to 4766 h



- □ 450 and 550°C/ 10⁻⁷ mass% oxygen
 - Protective scaling and selective leaching (SL)
 - Occasionally non-selective attack (general solution) at higher rate than SL
 - Comparatively long incubation of SL seems coupled to faster progress
 - Steel that showed highest relative resistance against SL at 450°C, corrodes fastest at 550°C (1.4571), and vice versa (316L)
 - 100–200 µm local material loss after 9000 h at 450°C, 150–600 µm after 2000 h at 550°C



T91 after exposure in the CORRIDA loop



□ 400°C/ 10⁻⁷ mass% oxygen

- Primarily accelerated oxidation (AO)
- Flawed and partially detached oxide scale
- Solution-based corrosion (SB) observed locally after 4766 h



☐ 450 and 550°C/ 10⁻⁷ mass% oxygen

- Protective scaling locally still evident, especially after shorter exposure time
- Dominant AO
- Possible incipient stages of SB after 500, clearly observed after 5000 h at 450°C
- At 550°C, incubation of SB between ~300 and 700 h
- ~50 µm maximum SB after 5000 h at 450°C, exceptionally severe attack observed on T91-B (950 µm) after 8766 h
- Maximum 190 µm after 1000 h at 550°C



Performance of the tubing of the CORRIDA loop

Sample T5 after 40,000 h at 385°C

- Position after the cooler, before magnetic trap
- No significant change in wall thickness after the long-term exposure
- Oxide deposits in adherent solidified LBE, but only in some distance from the tube wall
- Neither deposits nor significant amounts of oxide on the surface





Results from measuring the residual wall thickness in the microscope



Performance of the tubing of the CORRIDA loop



Corrosion scales formed in the hot leg (550°C)

- T3 (6000 h) and T4 (40,000 h) mainly show oxidation; T3 was not pre-oxidised
- T1 (23,000 h) and T2 (29,000 h) show significant selective leaching



Creep-to-Rupture tests in stagnant, oxygen-controlled liquid Pb at 650°C



CRISLA-capsule



CRISLA Facility for Creep-Rupture Tests in Lead



Automatik

Luftwert / SCCM 1.0000

Obergrenze / V

0,96500 itergrenze / \

Speichern: An/Aus

Beenden

Sonde L. vor

L. nach

c 1.1

c 1.2

c 1.3

۰.

. . .

10:58:56,514

14.01.2010

Intervall (s)

120

back. Freigabe 0

T, 1/*C 21,4864 T, a/*C 3,36965

.80

06:00:00

14.01.2010

10:58:11

14.01.2010

+ 🗩 🖑

100

PC-supported control system for oxygen content: user defined settings



Creep strength of T91 in air and lead at 650°C



Experimental and literature data for T91 in air



Creep strength of 14Cr-1W and 12Cr-2W ODS steels in stagnant lead (c_o =10⁻⁶ mass%) and air at 650°C



The 12-Cr ODS steel exhibits a slightly higher creep strength in stagnant Pb than the 14Cr-ODS steel



ODS steels against f/m steels T91 and P92, tested in air and lead at 650°C





Creep-rupture strength of 12Cr- and 14Cr-ODS steels is factor 2.5 higher then the f/m steels until t_R =10,000 h and show no LME in contrast to P92 tested in Pb.

12Cr-ODS steels after creep-to-rupture tests





Seminar on Corrosion Aspects in HLMs, October 31, 2014, INEST, Hefei, China

12Cr-ODS steels after creep-to-rupture tests







Longitudinal (a) and perpendicular (b) cross-sections of the steel ruptured after t_R =2,982 h in Pb at 329 MPa

Oxide scale is irregular and contains Fe, Cr and O. The thickness is up to 30 µm.
 Until 2,982h exposure to Pb, no dissolution of the steel was observed

Summary



- Heavy liquid metals (HLMs) are very appropriate coolants/targets for Nuclear (ADS, LFR) applications. Worldwide R&D has been established to buildup databases for compatibility issues of potential structural materials.
- F/M steels with 9%Cr show three stages of interaction with flowing LBE at 400-550°C, 10⁻⁷-10⁻⁶ mass% dissolved oxygen, 2 m/s
 - Protective scaling short term or local phenomenon (mainly at 400-450°C)
 - Oxidation the general degradation mechanism
 - Direct liquid-metal attack locally, after accumulation of liquid metal underneath the oxide scale
- Average rate of oxidation is lower
 - For higher Cr-content at 400-450°C
 - For fine-grained materials at 550°C
- Observed kinetics of oxidation is slower than parabolic
 - Corrosion rate increases by factor 2–3 for increase in temperature from 450 and 550°C
- Liquid metal attack shows
 - High local material loss in comparison to oxidation, e.g., increase by factor by factor 3–5 for T91 and 9%Cr-ODS at 550°C